



Infectivity of symptomatic and asymptomatic *Plasmodium vivax* infections to a Southeast Asian vector, *Anopheles dirus*

Kirakorn Kiattibutr, Wanlapa Roobsoong, Patchara Sriwichai, Teerawat Saeseu, Nattawan Rachaphaew, Chayanut Suansomjit, Sureemas Buates, Thomas Obadia, Ivo Mueller, Liwang Cui, et al.

► To cite this version:

Kirakorn Kiattibutr, Wanlapa Roobsoong, Patchara Sriwichai, Teerawat Saeseu, Nattawan Rachaphaew, et al.. Infectivity of symptomatic and asymptomatic *Plasmodium vivax* infections to a Southeast Asian vector, *Anopheles dirus*. *International Journal for Parasitology*, 2017, 47 (2-3), pp.163-170. 10.1016/j.ijpara.2016.10.006 . pasteur-02612668

HAL Id: pasteur-02612668

<https://pasteur.hal.science/pasteur-02612668>

Submitted on 1 Jun 2020

HAL is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers.

L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution - NonCommercial 4.0 International License

Infectivity of symptomatic and asymptomatic *Plasmodium vivax* infections
to a Southeast Asian vector *Anopheles dirus*

Kirakorn Kiatibutr^a, Wanlapa Roobsoong^a, Patchara Sriwichai^b, Teerawat Saeseu^a, Nattawan
Rachaphaew^a, Chayanut Suansomjit^c, Sureemas Buates^c, Thomas Obadia^d, Ivo Mueller^{d,e}, Liwang
Cui^f, Wang Nguitragool^{g,s}, Jetsumon Sattabongkot^{a,s}

^a Mahidol Vivax Research Unit, Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University,
Bangkok, Thailand

^b Department of Medical Entomology, Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University,
Bangkok, Thailand

^c Department of Microbiology, Faculty of Science, Mahidol University, Bangkok, Thailand

^d Malaria: Parasites & Hosts Unit, Department of Parasites & Insect Vectors, Institut Pasteur, Paris,
France

^e Population Health and Immunity Division, Walter and Eliza Hall Institute of Medical Research,
Melbourne, Australia

^f Department of Entomology, Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA, USA

^g Department of Molecular Tropical Medicine & Genetics, Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol
University, Bangkok, Thailand

^sCorresponding Authors:

Wang Nguitragool
Department of Molecular Tropical Medicine & Genetics, Faculty of Tropical Medicine,
Mahidol University, 420/6 Ratchawithi Road, Ratchathewi, Bangkok 10400 Thailand
Email: wang.ngu@mahidol.edu

Jetsumon Sattabongkot,
Mahidol Vivax Research Unit, Faculty of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University,
420/6 Ratchawithi Road, Ratchathewi, Bangkok 10400 Thailand
Email: jetsumon.pra@mahidol.ac.th

36 **ABSTRACT**

37 *Plasmodium vivax* is now the predominant species causing malarial infection and disease in most
38 non-African areas, but little is known about its transmission efficiency from human to mosquitoes.
39 Because the majority of *Plasmodium* infections in endemic areas are low density and asymptomatic,
40 it is important to evaluate how well these infections transmit. In this study, using direct membrane
41 feeding assays on *Anopheles dirus*, we assessed *P. vivax* infectivity from 94 naturally infected
42 individuals who had parasitemia spanning 4 orders of magnitude. We found that the mosquito
43 infection rate is positively correlated with blood parasitemia and that infection begins to rise when
44 the parasite density is >10 parasites/ μ l. Below this threshold, mosquito infection is rare and
45 associated with very few oocysts. These findings provide useful information for assessing the
46 human reservoir of transmission and for establishing diagnostic sensitivity required to identify
47 individuals who are most infectious to mosquitoes.

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

55

56 Keywords:

57 malaria, transmission, *Plasmodium vivax*, *Anopheles dirus*, infectivity, membrane feeding assay

58 1. Introduction

59 Over the past decade, malaria incidence has steadily declined in various parts of the worlds. In
60 many places where *P. falciparum* and *P. vivax* coexist, including South America, South East Asia
61 and Western Pacific, the latter has now become the predominant species (Imwong et al., 2015;
62 Oliveira-Ferreira et al., 2010; Rodriguez et al., 2011; Waltmann et al., 2015). The resilience of *P.*
63 *vivax* relative to *P. falciparum* against malaria controls can be attributed, at least partially, to the
64 parasite's ability to remain dormant as hypnozoites in the host liver (Krotoski et al., 1982; Robinson
65 et al., 2015; White et al., 2014) and its greater transmission efficiency (Boyd, 1937; Pethleart et al.,
66 2004). *P. vivax* thus poses a great challenge for malaria eradication. Because of the lack of an *in*
67 *vitro* culture system that produces infectious gametocytes, information about *P. vivax* transmission
68 efficiency is limited, and has mostly relied on direct or membrane feeding experiments using blood
69 from human malaria infections (Gamage-Mendis et al., 1993; Rios-Velasquez et al., 2013;
70 Sattabongkot et al., 2003; Sattabongkot et al., 1991; Vallejo et al., 2016; Zollner et al., 2006).

71
72 Several studies have reported that the majority of *P. vivax* infections in the endemic areas of Asia,
73 South America, and Oceania are asymptomatic (Baum et al., 2015; Harris et al., 2010; Imwong et
74 al., 2015; Vasquez-Jimenez et al., 2016; Waltmann et al., 2015) and submicroscopic (Cheng et al.,
75 2015), even in areas where malaria transmission intensity has declined. Previous studies have also
76 shown that blood from both *P. vivax* patients and asymptomatic carriers can infect South East Asian
77 vector *Anopheles dirus* (Coleman et al., 2004; Pethleart et al., 2004; Sattabongkot et al., 2003;
78 Sattabongkot et al., 1991), but the relationship between *P. vivax* parasitemia and the mosquito
79 infection rate is often described as weak if not absent (Bharti et al., 2006; Coleman et al., 2004;
80 Gamage-Mendis et al., 1991; Graves et al., 1988). At present, the relative contributions to
81 transmission of asymptomatic and symptomatic *P. vivax* infected populations remain unclear. Such
82 information is important for improving the current disease control and elimination programs. If

83 asymptomatic carriers are contributing substantially to transmission, then malaria interventions will
84 need to also target these carriers to be effective.

85

86 To determine how well *P. vivax* transmits from man to mosquitoes and to assess the contribution of
87 asymptomatic carriers to transmission, here we performed membrane feeding experiments on *An.*
88 *dirus* using blood samples from both *P. vivax* malaria patients and asymptomatic carriers. These
89 samples covered a broad range of parasitemia, from submicroscopic to 10,000 parasites/ μ l.

90

91 **2. Materials and methods**

92 *2.1 Study sites*

93 The study was conducted in Tha Song Yang District of Tak Province and Sai Yok District of
94 Kanchanaburi Province in western Thailand between 2014 and 2015. Both areas were mountainous
95 and residents were composed mainly of Thai and Karen ethnicities. The main occupations of the
96 participants were farmers. Malaria in the study areas was seasonal, with the major peak season
97 lasting from May to August, and a secondary peak in November to December. The prevalence of *P.*
98 *vivax* and *P. falciparum* in Tha Song Yang in 2011-2012 was approximately 10% and 3.7% by PCR
99 (Parker et al., 2015). Four anopheline species were recently found to be infected by *Plasmodium* in
100 this area, including *An. maculatus*, *An. minimus*, *An. annularis* and *An. barbirostris* (Sriwichai et
101 al., 2016). The prevalence of *P. vivax* and *P. falciparum* in our study site in Sai Yok was 3.8% and
102 1.4 % by PCR in 2012 (Nguitragool et al., submitted). No information is currently available about
103 the vectors in this area.

104

105 *2.2 Enrollment for membrane feeding experiments*

106 Enrollment was limited to ≥ 13 years old local residents whose blood was determined positive for
107 *Plasmodium* parasites. Participants were enrolled all year round either at local malaria clinics where
108 *P. vivax* was first identified by light microscopy, or through mass blood surveys of the general

109 village population by genus-specific LAMP (Han et al., 2007) or qRT-PCR (Wampfler et al., 2013).
110 During the enrollment process, body temperature of each participant was recorded by an infrared
111 thermometer. The history of recent malaria infection was obtained through interview. We classified
112 symptomatic individuals as those who felt sick with malaria-like symptoms (fever, headache, or
113 chill) or had temperature $> 37.5^{\circ}\text{C}$ at the time of the blood survey. Asymptomatic carriers were
114 *Plasmodium* positive individuals whose temperature at the time of blood survey was $< 37.5^{\circ}\text{C}$ and
115 reported absence of fever during the preceding two weeks. Informed consent or assent was obtained
116 from each participant as well as his/her legal guardian if the participant was < 18 years old. This
117 study was approved by the Ethics Committees of Mahidol University and Pennsylvania State
118 University.

119 In total, 222 individuals were included in the final data analysis. Individuals who were evidently
120 infected with *P. falciparum* were excluded. The 222 participants comprise 93 individuals who were
121 infected with *P. vivax* (70 symptomatic, 23 asymptomatic), 22 individuals who were infected with
122 *Plasmodium* parasites of unknown species, and 107 individuals whose blood was virtually free of
123 *Plasmodium* by genus-specific LAMP and qRT-PCR (details below).

124

125 2.3 Blood collection

126 Five milliliters of venous blood were collected from each participant in a heparinized tube. From
127 each whole blood sample, 200 μl blood was collected for parasite species identification by species-
128 specific LAMP assays (Han et al., 2007). A second portion of 200 μl was mixed with 1 ml
129 RNeasy Protect Cell Reagent (Qiagen) and stored at -80°C for RNA extraction and purification. A
130 second portion of thick and thin blood smears were prepared in duplicates using 1 μl whole blood
131 for each spot for microscopic examination. The rest of the sample was kept at 37°C and used in the
132 membrane feeding experiment within 4 h of collection.

133

134 2.4 Microscopic examination of blood smears

135 Thick and thin smears were prepared from whole blood. Thin smear was fixed with methanol,
136 while thick smear was left unfixed, before being stained with 10% Giemsa solution for 10 minutes
137 and examined for *Plasmodium* species and developmental stages. Parasite and gametocyte densities
138 were determined by counting the entire 1 µl blood spots.

139

140 2.5 LAMP assays

141 Genus-specific as well as species-specific (*P. falciparum* or *P. vivax*) LAMP assays (Han et al.,
142 2007) were performed to detect *Plasmodium* parasite infection in blood samples from the cross-
143 sectional surveys. To perform these LAMP assays, 150 µl of distilled water was added to 50 µl
144 blood and boiled for 5 minutes. The sample was then centrifuged for 3 minutes at 13,000 ×g. A
145 total volume of 5.5 µl of the supernatant containing genomic DNA was used as the template in a 25
146 µl LAMP reaction, using the Loopamp DNA amplification kit (Eiken Chemical Co) and an
147 appropriate primer set as previously described (Han et al., 2007; Sattabongkot et al., 2014). Only
148 samples that were free of *P. falciparum* were included in the final data analysis. The limits of the
149 LAMP assays for *P. falciparum* and *P. vivax* were 100 copies/reaction (Han et al., 2007).”

150

151 2.6 qRT-PCR analyses

152 RNA was extracted from 100 µl of whole blood in 500 µl RNeasy Protect Cell Reagent and eluted
153 with 50 µl elution buffer, following the instruction of the RNeasy Plus 96 kit (Qiagen). A genus-
154 specific qPCR assay, QMAL (Wampfler et al., 2013), using 4 µl of purified RNA as template, was
155 performed on all RNA samples to ensure no contamination of genomic DNA.

156 For blood samples from cross-sectional surveys, 4 µl of purified RNA was subjected to genus-
157 specific, as well as *P. vivax*-specific, qRT-PCR assays targeting the 18S rRNA transcripts. The
158 primer and probe sequences for this assay have been described previously (Rosanas-Urgell et al.,
159 2010).

160 To detect *P. vivax* gametocytes, 4 µl of purified RNA was used as the template in qRT-PCR to
161 amplify the *pvs25* transcripts (Wampfler et al., 2013). Copy numbers were determined from an in-
162 plate standard curve prepared by 10-fold serial dilution of a plasmid harboring the target sequence.
163 Values are reported as copies per µl of equivalent blood volume. To ensure that oocysts in
164 mosquitoes were not due to *P. falciparum* co-infection, qRT-PCR for *pfs25* transcripts was also
165 performed on all samples (Wampfler et al., 2013). Samples positive for *pfs25* transcripts were
166 excluded from the final analysis. The detection limits of qRT-PCR for *pvs25* and *pfs25* were 12
167 copies/reaction (Nguitragool et al., submitted).

168

169 2.7 Mosquito rearing

170 A colony of *An. dirus* was maintained in the insectary of Mahidol Vivax Research Unit, Faculty
171 of Tropical Medicine, Mahidol University in Bangkok, Thailand. The colony was established in
172 2011 from the original colony at Armed Force Research Institute of Medical Sciences, Bangkok
173 Thailand. The mosquito has been genetically typed and formally identified as *An. dirus* (originally
174 dirus A, Bangkok strain). The mosquitoes were reared at 27°C ($\pm$ 1°C), 80% ($\pm$ 10%) relative
175 humidity, and with a 12 h day/night cycle. For membrane feeding experiments, 200 female
176 mosquitoes/carton were placed inside an insulated plastic cooler and ground transported from
177 Bangkok to the field sites in Tha Song Yang and Sai Yok. Only 5-7 day-old mosquitoes were used
178 for membrane feeding assays. Mosquitoes were starved of sugar for 6 h before blood feeding.
179 Approximately 400 starved mosquitoes were used for each blood sample.

180

181 2.8 Membrane feeding assays

182 Each blood sample was prepared for membrane feeding assays (Sattabongkot et al., 2015) with
183 and without serum replacement. Serum replacement was performed to evaluate the effect of plasma
184 components on mosquito infection. To replace the serum, the original blood was centrifuged at 500
185 $\times$ g for 3 minutes, and the pellet was washed once with the RPMI medium before mixing with an

186 equal volume of AB-serum from a malaria naïve donor. To feed 200 female mosquitoes, 1 ml of
187 blood was added to a water-jacketed glass membrane feeder covered with a Baudruche membrane
188 and maintained at constant 37°C with a circulating-water system to prevent the transition of
189 gametocytes to gametes. Mosquitoes were allowed to feed for 30 minutes. All unfed mosquitoes
190 were removed and killed by freezing. Engorged mosquitoes were maintained with 10% sucrose
191 solution until transportation back to the insectary of Mahidol Vivax Research Unit in Bangkok.

192 Mosquito infection with *Plasmodium* oocysts was determined 7-9 days after blood feeding. At
193 least 30 mosquito midguts were dissected, stained with 0.05% mercurochrome, and examined for
194 oocysts under microscope. Each dissected midgut was counted once by an experienced
195 microscopist. The distribution of oocyst counts from infective cases of *P. vivax* can be found in
196 Supplementary Fig S1.

197

198 2.9 Data analysis

199 Data were analyzed with Graphpad Prism v.6.07, PASW Statistics v.18, and SigmaPlot v.13. For
200 each blood sample, infection rate (% mosquito infected) = $100 \times \text{number of mosquitoes with at least}$
201 $\text{one oocyst} / \text{total dissected}$. Oocyst density (oocysts/mosquito) = $\text{total number of oocysts found in all}$
202 $\text{mosquitoes} / \text{total mosquitoes dissected}$. Paired Wilcoxon signed rank test was used to compare the
203 median of the mosquito infection rates or of the mean oocyst densities between the feeding assays
204 with and without AB-serum replacement. Spearman's rank correlation coefficient (ρ) was used to
205 determine the correlation between parasite infection rates or oocyst density with parasite densities,
206 gametocyte density, and *pvs25* transcript abundance. Trend lines in Fig 2 represent 3-parameter
207 logistic regression. Trend lines in Fig 3 are thin plate regression splines whose smoothing
208 parameters were estimated with the generalized cross validation criteria. The analysis was
209 performed in R using the mgcv package.

210

211 2.9 Modeling the relationship between the mosquito infection rate and the oocyst density

212 To describe the relationship between the infection rate and the oocyst density, we assume that
 213 the number of oocysts in each midgut (N) arises from two types of ookinetes: i) ones that breach the
 214 peritrophic matrix (PM) and mature to oocysts (n_1) and ii) the ‘free riders’ that cross the PM
 215 through an opening generated by the first type of parasites (n_2). We further assume that n_1 is
 216 proportional to the ookinete density in the blood meal, and that n_2 scales linearly with the square of
 217 the ookinete density, following an empirical second order rate of collision between ookinetes and
 218 holes in the PM. Therefore, the number of oocysts in each midgut is: $N = n_1 + n_2 = n_1 + \alpha n_1^2$
 219 where α is an arbitrary constant. If the relationship between the infection rate r (percent) and n_1
 220 follows Poisson statistics, that is $r = 100(1 - e^{-n_1})$, then the relationship between r and N is

$$221 \quad r = 100(1 - e^{-\frac{\sqrt{1+4\alpha N}-1}{2\alpha}}).$$

222

223 3. Results

224 We performed membrane feeding experiments on 222 blood samples (Table 1). The
 225 demographic information of the blood donors as well as the raw membrane feeding data are
 226 available in Supplementary Table S1. In total, 94 of the samples were *P. vivax*-positive by light
 227 microscopy, Pv-LAMP, or qRT-PCR. 21 samples were *Plasmodium*-positive by genus-specific
 228 LAMP or qRT-PCR, but the species were indeterminate due to low parasitemia. The last 107
 229 samples were parasite negative by all diagnostics used (Table 1). None of the 222 samples was
 230 positive for *P. falciparum* by Pf-LAMP or *pfs25* qRT-PCR. Of the 94 *P. vivax* positive samples, 70
 231 were from symptomatic individuals and 24 were from asymptomatic individuals. Only 4 of the 24
 232 *P. vivax* asymptomatic infections were positive by light microscopy, all having very low
 233 parasitemia in the range 1 – 8 parasites/ μ l; the other 20 asymptomatic infections were positive for
 234 *P. vivax* only by LAMP and/or qRT-PCR.

235 Because the original blood plasma may contain components that interfere with transmission
 236 (Sattabongkot et al., 2003), we performed two feeding experiments on the majority of samples, one
 237 with the original plasma and the other after plasma had been replaced with AB-blood group serum

238 from a malaria-naïve person. Due to the limited blood volumes, we could only perform the feeding
239 assay without serum replacement for some samples.

240 Without serum replacement, 84% (59/70) of symptomatic *P. vivax* blood samples were infective
241 (i.e. at least one mosquito became infected with oocysts), with nearly 50% of all 4,389 mosquitoes
242 became infected. In contrast, none of the 23 asymptomatic *P. vivax* samples, and none of the 22
243 indeterminate *Plasmodium* samples, led to infection in the 4,955 mosquitoes dissected.
244 Interestingly, 4% (4/107) of whole blood samples and 5% (5/99) of serum replaced blood samples
245 which were negative for *Plasmodium* by both LAMP and qRT-PCR resulted in mosquito infection.
246 However, the infection rate (0.07%) was vastly lower than that of symptomatic blood (49.33%) and
247 all infected mosquitoes only had 1 – 2 oocysts.

248 AB-serum replacement did not have a big impact on the number of infective cases as well as in
249 the proportion of mosquitoes infected (Table 1). At the level of individual blood samples, AB-
250 serum replacement had variable effects (Fig. 1). It increased the infection rate (% mosquito
251 infected) and/or the mean oocyst density for some samples, but decreased these parameters for
252 others. In line with our findings here, similar blocking and enhancing effects of natural immunity
253 against sexual stages on transmission have been reported (Mendis et al., 1990). When data from all
254 paired samples were compared, the median of the infection rates ($p = 0.003$, $N = 86$) as well as that
255 of the mean oocyst densities ($p = 0.018$, $N = 86$) increased slightly.

256

257 3.1 *An. dirus* infection as a function of *P. vivax* density in blood

258 Among the blood samples with microscopically patent parasites, the blood parasite density was
259 positively correlated with the infection rate ($\rho = 0.386$, $p = 0.001$, $N = 70$; Fig. 2A). Positive
260 correlation was also found between the infection rate and gametocyte density ($\rho = 0.362$, $p = 0.003$,
261 $N = 65$; Fig. 2C) or *pvs25* transcript abundance ($\rho = 0.499$, $p = 5 \times 10^{-6}$, $N = 75$; Fig. 2E). Despite
262 the large sample-to-sample variation, the relationships between the infection rate and the parasite,
263 gametocyte, and *pvs25* transcript abundance are apparent when the moving median is plotted

264 against these density measures. The relationship appears to be sigmoidal, with the infection rate
265 beginning to rise sharply at >10 parasites/ μ l or >1 gametocyte/ μ l. The trends also became smoother
266 after AB-serum replacement (Fig. 2B, D, F).

267 The mean oocyst density calculated from all dissected mosquitoes (infected and uninfected)
268 generally increased with blood parasite density ($\rho = 0.432$, $p = 2 \times 10^{-4}$, $N = 70$; Fig. 3A),
269 gametocyte density ($\rho = 0.424$, $p = 4 \times 10^{-4}$, $N = 65$; Fig. 3C), and *pvs25* transcript abundance ($\rho =$
270 0.602 , $p = 1 \times 10^{-8}$, $N = 75$; Fig. 3E). However, in the highest decade of parasitemia or
271 gametocytemia, a reduction in oocyst density was observed (Fig. 3A, C, E), perhaps reflecting
272 inhibition by plasma components. Consistently, AB-serum replacement abrogated this inhibition,
273 leading to monotonically increasing relationships (Fig. 3B, D, F).

274

275 3.2 Relationship between the mosquito infection rate and the mean oocyst density

276 The infection rate was strongly correlated with the mean oocyst density ($\rho = 0.825$, $p = 9 \times 10^{-16}$, $N = 59$; Fig. 4). At low parasite densities, the relationship closely followed the prediction of
277 independent formations of individual oocysts. However, at higher parasite loads, the data deviated
278 from this *Poissonian* prediction – the mean oocyst density was higher than expected. These results
279 thus suggest some form of parasite-parasite interaction that becomes more prominent at higher
280 parasite density.

282

283 4. Discussion

284 We used membrane feeding assays to examine mosquito infectivity of blood samples from acute
285 *P. vivax* patients, asymptomatic carriers, and individuals living in the endemic areas who appeared
286 to be free of blood-stage parasites. Although the relationship between *P. vivax* parasitemias and
287 infection rates has often been described as weak or absent (Bharti et al., 2006; Coleman et al., 2004;
288 Gamage-Mendis et al., 1991; Graves et al., 1988), we could detect significant positive correlation
289 between *P. vivax* parasitemia and infection in *An. dirus*. We also found that parasitemia is as good a

290 predictor of infectivity as gametocytemia is, consistent with a previous report that for *P. vivax*
291 parasitemia and gametocytemia are tightly linked (Koepfli et al., 2015). That gametocyte counts did
292 not yield a stronger correlation with mosquito infectivity may also be due to our inability to
293 differentiate fully mature gametocytes from early non-infectious stages of gametocytes. The
294 probability that a single *An. dirus* would become infected with *P. vivax* from a symptomatic blood
295 meal was approximately 50%, similar to the previous report of 43% when the mosquito was
296 allowed to feed directly from the skin of symptomatic men in Thailand (Sattabongkot et al, 1991),
297 alleviating the concern that the membrane feeding assay may not represent natural infection.
298 Similar infection rates (45-60%) were also measured in *An. aquasalis* and *An. albitarsis* in
299 Brazilian Amazon and *An. albimanus* in Colombia by membrane feeding using patient blood
300 (Rios-Velasquez et al., 2013; Solarte et al., 2011; Vallejo et al., 2016). However, direct comparison
301 between membrane feeding and skin feeding remains an important step in the future to fully assess
302 how well the membrane feeding assay reflects natural infection, especially by asymptomatic
303 carriers whose parasitemia are generally very low and whose parasite distribution in the skin may
304 have great impact on mosquito infection.

305

306 We did not detect any infection among the 4,835 mosquitoes that had fed on the 23
307 asymptomatic *P. vivax* blood samples. This is likely due to the very low parasitemia of these
308 samples; 19 of them had submicroscopic parasite density (i.e. <1 parasite/ μ l for this study) and four
309 had only 1-8 parasites/ μ l. However, 5% of samples from qRT-PCR/LAMP negative participants
310 resulted in mosquito infections. These observations are consistent with the 10-100 parasites/ μ l
311 threshold for robust mosquito infection (Fig. 1A). Because of the limited sample size as well as the
312 skewed age distribution towards adults (13-59 years), these 23 samples may not represent the true
313 distribution of asymptomatic *P. vivax* parasitemias in the population. Interestingly, a recent
314 membrane feeding study from Colombia using *An. albimanus* found that 57% (8/14) of
315 submicroscopic asymptomatic blood samples led to mosquito infection at 2.5-5% infection rates

316 (Vallejo et al., 2016). These values are much higher than ours. We do not know the reason for this
317 discrepancy, but it is possible that different mosquito species are differently susceptible to the
318 parasite. Several anopheline species have been found our study area, including, but not limited to,
319 *An. maculatus*, *An. minimus*, *An. annularis*, *An. barbirostris*, and *An. dirus* (Sriwichai et al., 2016).
320 However, it still remains unclear which species are the main drivers of malaria transmission. We
321 used *An. dirus* in this study because it has high vectorial competence and wide geographical
322 distribution in South East Asia (Manguin et al., 2008). Our infectivity data here should therefore be
323 used judiciously in the context of malaria control programs where a different or multiple mosquito
324 species contribute to transmission.

325
326 Through a series of malaria cross-sectional surveys conducted in several endemic villages in
327 northwestern Thailand and western Cambodia, Imwong and coworkers recently estimated the
328 overall prevalence of *P. vivax* to be ~17% (Imwong et al., 2016). They also determined the *P. vivax*
329 parasitemia distribution in these populations to be unimodal and log normal, peaking at 5
330 parasites/ μ l. Assuming this distribution, 14% of all asymptotically infected individuals are
331 predicted to have >100 parasites/ μ l, the density at which efficient *An. dirus* infection was observed
332 (Fig. 2). This translates to 2.4% of the population (i.e. 14% of the 17% asymptomatic *P. vivax*
333 prevalence) being able to transmit. This number of infectious asymptomatic individuals exceeds
334 that of the symptomatic malaria patients at any given time. It thus follows that, if *An. dirus* is
335 representative of Southeast Asian vectors, asymptomatic *P. vivax* carriers should contribute
336 substantially to transmission. The outdoor biting behaviors of *An. dirus* (Tananchai et al., 2012),
337 which favor transmission from physically active individuals, can only enhance the contribution of
338 the asymptomatic carriers relative to that of the symptomatic patients.

339
340 Although the threshold for *P. vivax* transmission in *An. dirus* appears to be 10-100 parasites/ μ l,
341 we believe that it is important for targeted elimination approaches to employ a diagnostic tool that

342 can detect lower parasite densities. This is because 1) parasitemia in asymptomatic carriers can
343 fluctuate and reach the transmissible densities if left untreated and 2) other local mosquito species
344 may be more susceptible to infection than *An. dirus*. Our data suggested that microscopy and
345 commercial malaria rapid diagnostic tests, which typically have the limit of detection of roughly 50
346 and 100-200 parasites/ μ l respectively (Ochola et al., 2006; WHO, 2012), will likely miss a
347 significant portion of the infectious reservoir. Molecular diagnostics such as low-volume LAMP
348 and PCR, which can detect a few parasites/ μ l (Cordray and Richards-Kortum, 2012), should fare
349 much better in the programmatic settings. They should be able to identify the large majority of
350 currently transmitting individuals. However, even people with no detectable *P. vivax* blood stage
351 infection can harbor hypnozoites and may thus experience relapsing *P. vivax* infection and
352 contribute to transmission (Robinson et al., 2015). Programs aiming at vivax malaria elimination
353 will thus not only need to identify people that can transmit now, but also address the silent
354 hypnozoite reservoir and reintroduction of the parasite through migration.

355

356 **Acknowledgements**

357 This study was supported by the TransEPI consortium funded by the Bill & Melinda Gates
358 Foundation (www.gatesfoundation.org) and NIH International Centers of Excellence in Malaria
359 Research grant (U19 AI089672, www.niaid.nih.gov). We greatly appreciate the contribution to
360 microscopic examinations of blood samples by Mrs. Nongnuj Maneechai. IM is supported by an
361 NHMRC Senior Research Fellowship. WN is supported by a Wellcome Trust Intermediate
362 Fellowship in Public Health and Tropical Medicine.

- Baum, E., Sattabongkot, J., Sirichaisinthop, J., Kiattibutr, K., Davies, D.H., Jain, A., Lo, E., Lee, M.C., Randall, A.Z., Molina, D.M., Liang, X., Cui, L., Felgner, P.L., Yan, G., 2015. Submicroscopic and asymptomatic *Plasmodium falciparum* and *Plasmodium vivax* infections are common in western Thailand - molecular and serological evidence. *Malar J* 14, 95.
- Bharti, A.R., Chuquiyauri, R., Brouwer, K.C., Stancil, J., Lin, J., Llanos-Cuentas, A., Vinetz, J.M., 2006. Experimental infection of the neotropical malaria vector *Anopheles darlingi* by human patient-derived *Plasmodium vivax* in the Peruvian Amazon. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 75, 610-616.
- Boyd, M.F.K., S.F., 1937. On the Infectiousness of Patients Infected with *Plasmodium Vivax* and *Plasmodium Falciparum*. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 1-17, 253-262.
- Cheng, Q., Cunningham, J., Gatton, M.L., 2015. Systematic review of sub-microscopic *P. vivax* infections: prevalence and determining factors. *PLoS neglected tropical diseases* 9, e3413.
- Coleman, R.E., Kumpitak, C., Ponlawat, A., Maneechai, N., Phunkitchar, V., Rachapaew, N., Zollner, G., Sattabongkot, J., 2004. Infectivity of asymptomatic *Plasmodium*-infected human populations to *Anopheles dirus* mosquitoes in western Thailand. *J Med Entomol* 41, 201-208.
- Cordray, M.S., Richards-Kortum, R.R., 2012. Emerging nucleic acid-based tests for point-of-care detection of malaria. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 87, 223-230.
- Gamage-Mendis, A.C., Rajakaruna, J., Carter, R., Mendis, K.N., 1991. Infectious reservoir of *Plasmodium vivax* and *Plasmodium falciparum* malaria in an endemic region of Sri Lanka. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 45, 479-487.
- Gamage-Mendis, A.C., Rajakaruna, J., Weerasinghe, S., Mendis, C., Carter, R., Mendis, K.N., 1993. Infectivity of *Plasmodium vivax* and *P. falciparum* to *Anopheles tessellatus*; relationship between oocyst and sporozoite development. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg* 87, 3-6.
- Graves, P.M., Burkot, T.R., Carter, R., Cattani, J.A., Lagog, M., Parker, J., Brabin, B.J., Gibson, F.D., Bradley, D.J., Alpers, M.P., 1988. Measurement of malarial infectivity of human populations to mosquitoes in the Madang area, Papua, New Guinea. *Parasitology* 96 (Pt 2), 251-263.
- Han, E.T., Watanabe, R., Sattabongkot, J., Khuntirat, B., Sirichaisinthop, J., Iriko, H., Jin, L., Takeo, S., Tsuboi, T., 2007. Detection of four *Plasmodium* species by genus- and species-specific loop-mediated isothermal amplification for clinical diagnosis. *J Clin Microbiol* 45, 2521-2528.
- Harris, I., Sharrock, W.W., Bain, L.M., Gray, K.A., Bobogare, A., Boaz, L., Lilley, K., Krause, D., Vallely, A., Johnson, M.L., Gatton, M.L., Shanks, G.D., Cheng, Q., 2010. A large proportion of asymptomatic *Plasmodium* infections with low and sub-microscopic parasite densities in the low transmission setting of Temotu Province, Solomon Islands: challenges for malaria diagnostics in an elimination setting. *Malar J* 9, 254.
- Imwong, M., Nguyen, T.N., Tripura, R., Peto, T.J., Lee, S.J., Lwin, K.M., Suangkanarat, P., Jeeyapant, A., Vihokhern, B., Wongsan, K., Van Hue, D., Dong le, T., Nguyen, T.U., Lubell, Y., von Seidlein, L., Dhorda, M., Promnarate, C., Snounou, G., Malleret, B., Renia, L., Keereecharoen, L., Singhasivanon, P., Sirithiranont, P., Chalk, J., Nguon, C., Hien, T.T., Day, N., White, N.J., Dondorp, A., Nosten, F., 2015. The epidemiology of subclinical malaria infections in South-East Asia: findings from cross-sectional surveys in Thailand-Myanmar border areas, Cambodia, and Vietnam. *Malar J* 14, 381.
- Imwong, M., Stepniewska, K., Tripura, R., Peto, T.J., Lwin, K.M., Vihokhern, B., Wongsan, K., von Seidlein, L., Dhorda, M., Snounou, G., Keereecharoen, L., Singhasivanon, P., Sirithiranont, P., Chalk, J., Nguon, C., Day, N.P., Nosten, F., Dondorp, A., White, N.J., 2016. Numerical Distributions of Parasite Densities During Asymptomatic Malaria. *J Infect Dis* 213, 1322-1329.
- Koepfli, C., Robinson, L.J., Rarau, P., Salib, M., Sambale, N., Wampfler, R., Betuela, I., Nuitragool, W., Barry, A.E., Siba, P., Felger, I., Mueller, I., 2015. Blood-Stage Parasitaemia and Age Determine *Plasmodium falciparum* and *P. vivax* Gametocytaemia in Papua New Guinea. *PLoS One* 10, e0126747.

413 Krotoski, W.A., Collins, W.E., Bray, R.S., Garnham, P.C., Cogswell, F.B., Gwadz, R.W., Killick-
 414 Kendrick, R., Wolf, R., Sinden, R., Koontz, L.C., Stanfill, P.S., 1982. Demonstration of
 415 hypnozoites in sporozoite-transmitted *Plasmodium vivax* infection. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 31,
 416 1291-1293.
 417 Manguin, S., Garros, C., Dusfour, I., Harbach, R.E., Coosemans, M., 2008. Bionomics, taxonomy,
 418 and distribution of the major malaria vector taxa of *Anopheles* subgenus *Cellia* in Southeast
 419 Asia: an updated review. *Infect Genet Evol* 8, 489-503.
 420 Mendis, K.N., David, P.H., Carter, R., 1990. Human immune responses against sexual stages of
 421 malaria parasites: considerations for malaria vaccines. *Int J Parasitol* 20, 497-502.
 422 Ochola, L.B., Vounatsou, P., Smith, T., Mabaso, M.L., Newton, C.R., 2006. The reliability of
 423 diagnostic techniques in the diagnosis and management of malaria in the absence of a gold
 424 standard. *Lancet Infect Dis* 6, 582-588.
 425 Oliveira-Ferreira, J., Lacerda, M.V., Brasil, P., Ladislau, J.L., Tauil, P.L., Daniel-Ribeiro, C.T., 2010.
 426 Malaria in Brazil: an overview. *Malar J* 9, 115.
 427 Parker, D.M., Matthews, S.A., Yan, G., Zhou, G., Lee, M.C., Sirichaisinthop, J., Kiattibutr, K., Fan,
 428 Q., Li, P., Sattabongkot, J., Cui, L., 2015. Microgeography and molecular epidemiology of
 429 malaria at the Thailand-Myanmar border in the malaria pre-elimination phase. *Malar J* 14,
 430 198.
 431 Pethleart, A., Prajakwong, S., Suwonkerd, W., Corthong, B., Webber, R., Curtis, C., 2004.
 432 Infectious reservoir of *Plasmodium* infection in Mae Hong Son Province, north-west Thailand.
 433 *Malar J* 3, 34.
 434 Rios-Velasquez, C.M., Martins-Campos, K.M., Simoes, R.C., Izzo, T., dos Santos, E.V., Pessoa, F.A.,
 435 Lima, J.B., Monteiro, W.M., Secundino, N.F., Lacerda, M.V., Tadei, W.P., Pimenta, P.F., 2013.
 436 Experimental *Plasmodium vivax* infection of key *Anopheles* species from the Brazilian
 437 Amazon. *Malar J* 12, 460.
 438 Robinson, L.J., Wampfler, R., Betuela, I., Karl, S., White, M.T., Li Wai Suen, C.S., Hofmann, N.E.,
 439 Kinboro, B., Waltmann, A., Brewster, J., Lorry, L., Tarongka, N., Samol, L., Silkey, M., Bassat, Q.,
 440 Siba, P.M., Schofield, L., Felger, I., Mueller, I., 2015. Strategies for understanding and reducing
 441 the *Plasmodium vivax* and *Plasmodium ovale* hypnozoite reservoir in Papua New Guinean
 442 children: a randomised placebo-controlled trial and mathematical model. *PLoS Med* 12,
 443 e1001891.
 444 Rodriguez, J.C., Uribe, G.A., Araujo, R.M., Narvaez, P.C., Valencia, S.H., 2011. Epidemiology and
 445 control of malaria in Colombia. *Mem Inst Oswaldo Cruz* 106 Suppl 1, 114-122.
 446 Rosanas-Urgell, A., Mueller, D., Betuela, I., Barnadas, C., Iga, J., Zimmerman, P.A., del Portillo,
 447 H.A., Siba, P., Mueller, I., Felger, I., 2010. Comparison of diagnostic methods for the detection
 448 and quantification of the four sympatric *Plasmodium* species in field samples from Papua New
 449 Guinea. *Malar J* 9, 361.
 450 Sattabongkot, J., Kumpitak, C., Kiattibutr, K., 2015. Membrane Feeding Assay to Determine the
 451 Infectiousness of *Plasmodium vivax* Gametocytes. *Methods Mol Biol* 1325, 93-99.
 452 Sattabongkot, J., Maneechai, N., Phunkitchar, V., Eikarat, N., Khuntirat, B., Sirichaisinthop, J.,
 453 Burge, R., Coleman, R.E., 2003. Comparison of artificial membrane feeding with direct skin
 454 feeding to estimate the infectiousness of *Plasmodium vivax* gametocyte carriers to
 455 mosquitoes. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 69, 529-535.
 456 Sattabongkot, J., Maneechai, N., Rosenberg, R., 1991. *Plasmodium vivax*: gametocyte infectivity
 457 of naturally infected Thai adults. *Parasitology* 102 Pt 1, 27-31.
 458 Sattabongkot, J., Tsuboi, T., Han, E.T., Bantuchai, S., Buates, S., 2014. Loop-mediated isothermal
 459 amplification assay for rapid diagnosis of malaria infections in an area of endemicity in
 460 Thailand. *J Clin Microbiol* 52, 1471-1477.
 461 Solarte, Y., Manzano, M.R., Rocha, L., Hurtado, H., James, M.A., Arevalo-Herrera, M., Herrera, S.,
 462 2011. *Plasmodium vivax* sporozoite production in *Anopheles albimanus* mosquitoes for
 463 vaccine clinical trials. *Am J Trop Med Hyg* 84, 28-34.

464 Sriwichai, P., Samung, Y., Sumruayphol, S., Kiattibutr, K., Kumpitak, C., Payakkapol, A.,
 465 Kaewkungwal, J., Yan, G., Cui, L., Sattabongkot, J., 2016. Natural human *Plasmodium* infections
 466 in major *Anopheles* mosquitoes in western Thailand. *Parasit Vectors* 9, 17.
 467 Tananchai, C., Tisgratog, R., Juntarajumnong, W., Grieco, J.P., Manguin, S., Prabaripai, A.,
 468 Chareonviriyaphap, T., 2012. Species diversity and biting activity of *Anopheles dirus* and
 469 *Anopheles baimaii* (Diptera: Culicidae) in a malaria prone area of western Thailand. *Parasit*
 470 *Vectors* 5, 211.
 471 Vallejo, A.F., Garcia, J., Amado-Garavito, A.B., Arevalo-Herrera, M., Herrera, S., 2016.
 472 *Plasmodium vivax* gametocyte infectivity in sub-microscopic infections. *Malar J* 15, 48.
 473 Vasquez-Jimenez, J.M., Arevalo-Herrera, M., Henao-Giraldo, J., Molina-Gomez, K., Arce-Plata,
 474 M., Vallejo, A.F., Herrera, S., 2016. Consistent prevalence of asymptomatic infections in malaria
 475 endemic populations in Colombia over time. *Malar J* 15, 70.
 476 Waltrmann, A., Darcy, A.W., Harris, I., Koepfli, C., Lodo, J., Vahi, V., Piziki, D., Shanks, G.D., Barry,
 477 A.E., Whittaker, M., Kazura, J.W., Mueller, I., 2015. High Rates of Asymptomatic, Sub-
 478 microscopic *Plasmodium vivax* Infection and Disappearing *Plasmodium falciparum* Malaria in
 479 an Area of Low Transmission in Solomon Islands. *PLoS Negl Trop Dis* 9, e0003758.
 480 Wampfler, R., Mwingira, F., Javati, S., Robinson, L., Betuela, I., Siba, P., Beck, H.P., Mueller, I.,
 481 Felger, I., 2013. Strategies for detection of *Plasmodium* species gametocytes. *PLoS One* 8,
 482 e76316.
 483 White, M.T., Karl, S., Battle, K.E., Hay, S.I., Mueller, I., Ghani, A.C., 2014. Modelling the
 484 contribution of the hypnozoite reservoir to *Plasmodium vivax* transmission. *Elife* 3.
 485 WHO, 2012. Malaria Rapid Diagnostic Test Performance. Results of WHO Product Testing of
 486 Malaria RDTs: Round 4.
 487 Zollner, G.E., Ponsa, N., Garman, G.W., Poudel, S., Bell, J.A., Sattabongkot, J., Coleman, R.E.,
 488 Vaughan, J.A., 2006. Population dynamics of sporogony for *Plasmodium vivax* parasites from
 489 western Thailand developing within three species of colonized *Anopheles* mosquitoes. *Malar J*
 490 5, 68.
 491

492 **Legends to Figures**

493 Fig 1. Distribution of fold changes ($\log_2$ transformed) in the infection rate (A) and the mean oocyst
494 density (B) between experiments with AB-serum replacement (AB) and the original whole blood
495 (WB). A positive value indicates enhancement by serum replacement. A negative value indicates
496 inhibition by serum replacement. Only experiments with non-zero oocysts in both experimental
497 arms were included.

498

499 Fig 2. Relationship between the mosquito infection rate and *P. vivax* parasite, gametocyte, and
500 *pvs25* transcript densities in blood. Circles represent the infection rates of individual feeding
501 experiments. Trend lines are 3 parameter logistic regression; the shaded areas represent the 95%
502 confidence intervals. A, C, E: experiments without AB-serum replacement. B, D, F: experiments
503 with AB-serum replacement. nd, not detected.

504

505 Fig 3. Relationship between the mean oocyst density of each membrane feeding experiment and *P.*
506 *vivax* parasite, gametocyte, and *pvs25* transcript densities in blood. Circles represent the mean
507 oocyst densities of individual experiments. Trend lines are regression splines; the shaded areas
508 represent the 95% confidence intervals. A, C, E: experiments without AB-serum replacement. B, D,
509 F: experiments with AB-serum replacement. nd, not detected.

510

511 Fig 4. Relationship between the mean oocyst density and the infection rate of *P. vivax*. Circles
512 represent values from individual feeding experiments with AB serum replacement. Dash line, $y =$
513 $100(1 - e^{-x})$, depicts the prediction of the Poisson infection process. Solid red line is the best fit
514 ($\alpha = 2.29$) of the same infection process but allowing *free rider* parasites.

Table 1. Summary of the mosquito membrane feeding assays

blood infection	% infective cases (infective cases/total fed)		% mosquitoes infected (infected mosquitoes/total dissected)	
	WB ⁵	AB ⁶	WB	AB
<i>P. vivax</i> , symptomatic ¹	84 (59/70)	88 (59/67)	49.33 (2,165/4,389)	55.51 (2,352/4,237)
<i>P. vivax</i> , asymptomatic ²	0 (0/24)	0 (0/19)	0 (0/2,678)	0 (0/2,157)
<i>indeterminate</i> <i>Plasmodium</i> ³	0 (0/21)	0 (0/20)	0 (0/2,277)	0 (0/2,182)
parasite not detected ⁴	4 (4/107)	5 (5/99)	0.07 (8/11,681)	0.05 (6/11,334)

¹ *P. vivax* was detected by light microscopy or qRT-PCR.

² *P. vivax* was detected by LAMP or qRT-PCR.

³ *Plasmodium* parasite was detected by genus-specific LAMP or qRT-PCR, but the species of the parasite could not be identified due to low parasitemia. All samples were negative by light microscopy.

⁴ Parasite was not detected by LAMP and qRT-PCR.

⁵ Original whole blood

⁶ AB-serum replaced blood











